



THE UNIVERSITY OF ZAMBIA
SCHOOL OF MEDICINE

**Comparing the diagnostic performance of two smears versus
three smears for the diagnosis of pulmonary tuberculosis in
selected health centers of Lusaka district, Zambia**

Eddie Solo (BSc Biomedical Sciences)

Computer number: 529002923

A dissertation submitted to the University of Zambia in partial fulfillment of
requirements for the Masters Degree in Public Health (MPH).

October, 2013

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Item	Page
<u>Declaration.....</u>	<u>iv</u>
<u>Certificate of Approval.....</u>	<u>v</u>
<u>Dedication.....</u>	<u>vi</u>
<u>Acknowledgement.....</u>	<u>vii</u>
<u>Acronyms.....</u>	<u>viii</u>
<u>List of tables and figures.....</u>	<u>x</u>
<u>Definitions of terms.....</u>	<u>xi</u>
<u>Abstract.....</u>	<u>xii</u>

CHAPTER ONE

1.0 <u>Background.....</u>	<u>1</u>
1.1 <u>Statement of the problem.....</u>	<u>3</u>
1.2 <u>Study Justification.....</u>	<u>4</u>
1.3 <u>Research question.....</u>	<u>4</u>
1.4 <u>Study objectives.....</u>	<u>4</u>
1.4.1 <u>Main Objective.....</u>	<u>4</u>
1.4.2 <u>Specific Objectives.....</u>	<u>5</u>

CHAPTER TWO

2.0 <u>Literature review.....</u>	<u>6</u>
2.1 <u>Global perspective.....</u>	<u>6</u>
2.2 <u>Regional perspective.....</u>	<u>7</u>

2.3 <u>National perspective</u>	9
---------------------------------------	---

CHAPTER THREE

3.0 <u>Methodologies</u>	10
3.1 <u>Study design</u>	10
3.2 <u>Study settings</u>	10
3.3 <u>Study population</u>	11
3.4 <u>Eligibility criteria</u>	11
3.5 <u>Sample size</u>	11
3.6 <u>Sampling</u>	13
3.7 <u>Specimen collection</u>	13
3.8.0 <u>Data collection techniques</u>	13
3.8.1 <u>Review of records</u>	13
3.8.2 <u>Smear microscopy</u>	13
3.8.3 <u>Sputum culture</u>	14
3.9. <u>Data analysis methods</u>	15
3.10. <u>Quality assurance</u>	16
3.11. <u>Ethical Considerations</u>	16

CHAPTER FOUR

4.0 <u>Results</u>	17
--------------------------	----

CHAPTER FIVE

<u>Discussion</u>	23
<u>Study limitations</u>	26
<u>Future directions</u>	26
<u>Conclusion</u>	26
<u>References</u>	28
<u>Appendices</u>	32

DECLARATIONS

This dissertation is the original work of Eddie Solo. It has been prepared in accordance with the guidelines for MPH dissertations of the University Of Zambia. It has not been submitted elsewhere for a degree at this or another university.

Signature..... Date.....

FOR SUPERVISORS ONLY

I have read this dissertation and approved it for examination.

Dr Trevor Kaile,

Head of Department,

Department of Pathology and Microbiology,

School of Medicine,

University of Zambia,

Signature..... Date.....

Professor Seter Siziya

Lecturer

School of Medicine,

Copperbelt University.

Signature Date.....

CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

This dissertation of Mr. Eddie Solo is approved as part of the fulfillment of the requirements of the award of the degree of Masters of Public Health by the University of Zambia.

Examiners' signatures

.....Date.....

.....Date.....

.....Date.....

DEDICATION

I dedicate this dissertation to my Son Kuken'ga Solo. I know you will equally perform well academically because you seem to like school.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the laboratory staff of the following health facilities; Kamwala, Chilenje, Kabwata, Kanyama and University Teaching Hospital tuberculosis laboratory for their participation in the study. I especially thank Professor Seter Siziya, Dr Trevor Kaile, Dr Ahmed Yusuf and Mrs. Alice Hazemba for supervising my project. The critical comments received from Mrs. Charity Habenzu and Mr. Mpanga Kasonde, are appreciated. I acknowledge the financial support from The Zambian Ministry of Health. Lastly, I would like to thank my wife, Sporah Chisha for the encouragement rendered during the writing of this dissertation.

ACRONYMS

AFB	Acid Fast Bacilli
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
CDC	Centers for Disease Control and prevention
CDL	Chest Diseases Laboratory
CIDRZ	Center for Infectious Diseases Research in Zambia
CSO	Central Statistics Office
EQA	External Quality Assessment
FIND	Foundation for Innovate New Diagnostics
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IUATLD	International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
LDHMT	Lusaka District Health Management Team
LJ	Lowenstein Jensen
MGIT	Mycobacteria Growth Indicator Tube
MoH	Ministry of Health
MRC	Medical Research Council
NPV	Negative Predictive Value
LR-	Negative likelihood ratio
NTP	National Tuberculosis Control Program

LR+	Positive likelihood ratio
PPV	Positive Predictive Value
PTB	Pulmonary Tuberculosis
SS+	Sputum Smear positive
SS-	Sputum Smear Negative
TB	Tuberculosis
TDR	Tropical Diseases Research
UNZA	University of Zambia
UTH	University Teaching Hospital
WHO	World Health Organization
ZAMBART	Zambia Aids Related Tuberculosis.
TCTA	Tuberculosis Coalition for Technical Assistance
ZN	Zielh Neelsen

List of tables and figures

Table.1. Grading of Ziehl Neelsen smear microscopy.

Table.2. Illustrating results for LJ culture and smear microscopy.

Table.3. Analyzing diagnostic performance of three smears strategy against LJ culture.

Table.4. Analyzing the diagnostic performance of two smears strategy against culture.

Figure.1. Showing proportion of patients detected on first, second and third smears respectively.

Table.5. Comparing the sensitivity, specificity, PPV, NPV, test efficiency, LR+ and LR- for three and two smear strategies.

DEFINITIONS OF TERMS

Sensitivity: the ability of the test to detect a disease when it is present.

Specificity: the ability of a test to indicate non disease when no disease is available.

Positive predictive Value (PPV): the probability of a disease being present when the test results are positive.

Negative Predictive Value (NPV): the probability of a disease being absent when the test results are negative.

ABSTRACT

Current World Health Organization (WHO) and International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases (IUATLD) guidelines recommend that patients suspected of pulmonary tuberculosis (PTB) should submit three sputum samples as ‘spot’, ‘morning’ and another ‘spot’. In recent years some TB experts have challenged the policy of examining three sputum samples per patient suspected of PTB. Arguments advanced are that these guidelines are based on old studies; increases cost and are not rewarding or cost effective. These experts have therefore suggested reducing the number of sputum samples required to be examined for diagnosis of PTB from the conventional three smears to two, particularly in resource limited settings. WHO has responded to this debate by recommending country specific studies to evaluate the operational effectiveness of the proposed two smears policy. The objective of this study was to compare the performance of the suggested two smears and the conventional three smears for the diagnosis of PTB in selected health centers of Lusaka district.

Between January 2011 and May 2012, we conducted a cross sectional study by reviewing routine Ziehl Neelsen (ZN) smear results in four urban health centers laboratory registers and at the same time stored their actual sputum samples after routine use. We stratified the three routine smear results to form two strategies, namely; ‘three smear strategy’ (by considering results for all the three samples) and ‘two smear strategy’ (by restricting our analysis to the results for the first two samples). The stored specimens were transported to University Teaching Hospital TB laboratory for culture on Lowenstein Jensen (LJ) slopes. LJ culture results acted as gold standard and were used to compute the sensitivity, specificity, Positive Predictive Value (PPV), Negative Predictive Value (NPV), test efficiency and likelihood ratios for three smears strategy and two smears strategy respectively. We then compared the performances of the two strategies by testing the differences in the above variables using Yates’s corrected Chi-square test. A result yielding a p value of $p < 0.05$ was statistically significant.

Out of 1030 TB suspects analyzed, 350 were positive on LJ cultures providing a positivity rate of 34.0% (95% CI: 31.1%, 36.9%).

The sensitivity for three smears strategy was 61.4% (95% CI: 56.1%, 66.5%), whereas that for two smears strategy was 57.7% (95% CI: 52.5%, 62.9%), $p = 0.355$. The specificity for both three smear and two smear strategies was 98.1% (95% CI: 97.1%, 98.9%). The test efficiency for three smears strategy was 85.6% (95% CI: 83.4%, 87.7%), while that of two smears was 84.4% (95% CI: 82.2%, 86.6%), $p = 0.459$. The positive likelihood ratio for three smears strategy was 32.3 (95% CI: 18.6, 55.4) and for two smears strategy was 30.3 (95% CI: 17.5, 52.1), $P = 0.96$. The negative likelihood ratio for three smears strategy was 0.39 (95% CI: 0.34, 0.44) whereas for two smears strategy was 0.43 (95% CI: 0.38, 0.48), $p = 0.882$. The p-values for all the variables tested showed no significant differences between the two strategies.

The performances of the two strategies were similar therefore this study concludes that the two smears strategy for diagnosis of pulmonary tuberculosis is adopted for Zambia.

